



DEPARTMENT OF PLANNING
STAFF REPORT

PLANNING COMMISSION PUBLIC HEARING

DATE OF HEARING: MARCH 19, 2009

ZMAP 2008-0015

**DELETION OF LAND FROM THE GOOSE CREEK HISTORIC AND CULTURAL
CONSERVATION DISTRICT - MILLER PROPERTY**

DECISION DEADLINE: August 14, 2009

ELECTION DISTRICT: Blue Ridge PROJECT PLANNER: Marchant Schneider

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Daniel D. and Elizabeth J. Miller of Purcellville, Virginia, have submitted a zoning map amendment application (ZMAP) to remove an approximately 0.77 acre portion of a 0.99 acre property in the Village of Lincoln from the existing Goose Creek Historic and Cultural Conservation Overlay District (HCC). The remaining 0.22 acre portion of the property is not currently located within the Goose Creek Historic District. A Historic District designation operates as an overlay zone in addition to existing zoning district regulations applicable to the subject property. Among the effects of inclusion in a Historic District is the requirement of architectural review and approval by the Historic District Review Committee (HDRC) prior to: (1) alterations to existing structures, (2) the construction of any new structure; (3) an addition to an existing structure; or (4) the demolition of an existing structure located within the boundary of a Historic District. Requests for deletion from a Historic District may be filed pursuant to Section 6-1807 of the Revised 1993 Loudoun County Zoning Ordinance.

The subject property is located on the east side of Lincoln Road (Route 722), approximately 0.1 mile north of Sands Road (Route 709) at 37824 Friendly Lane. The property is zoned CR-2 (Countryside Residential-2) and RC (Rural Commercial) and is also located within the VCOD (Village Conservation Overlay District – Village of Lincoln) and is a contributing property to the Goose Creek Historic District overlay.

The area is governed by the policies of the Revised General Plan (Rural Policy Area and Existing Village Policy Area - Village of Lincoln) and the Heritage Preservation Plan, which designate this area for residential uses, recommend the protection and preservation of Loudoun County's heritage resources, and support the establishment of boundaries of the Historic and Cultural Conservation Districts to coincide with the boundaries of national and state historic districts. In addition to local historic district designation, the Goose Creek Historic District is listed in the National Register of Historic Places and in the Virginia Landmarks Register.

RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends denial of the application. The request to remove property from the Goose Creek Historic and Cultural Conservation Overlay District is inconsistent with the Revised General Plan and the Heritage Preservation Plan which recommend the protection and preservation of Loudoun County's heritage resources and support the establishment and expansion of the Historic Districts within Loudoun County. Further, the application does not meet the Zoning Ordinance criteria necessary for removal from the Goose Creek Historic and Cultural Conservation Overlay District (Section 6-1803(B)).

SUGGESTED MOTIONS

1. I move that the Planning Commission forward ZMAP 2008-0015, Miller Property, to the Board of Supervisors with a recommendation of denial, based on the Findings attached.

OR,

2. I move that the Planning Commission forward ZMAP 2008-0015, Miller Property, to a subsequent worksession for further discussion.

OR,

3. I move that the Planning Commission forward ZMAP 2008-0015, Miller Property, to the Board of Supervisors with a recommendation of approval, based on the following Findings:

OR,

4. I move an alternate motion.

VICINITY MAP



Directions:

From Leesburg, take Route 7 west. Travel approximately 6 miles to Berlin Turnpike (Route 287) and travel south. Turn right onto Main Street East (Business Route 7). Turn left on 10th Street / Lincoln Road (Route 772). Travel approximately 1.5 miles. The property is located on the east side of Lincoln Road at 37824 Friendly Lane.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	Application Information	5
II.	Summary of Discussion	6
III.	Findings	7
IV.	Project Review.....	8
	A. Context	8
	B. Summary of Outstanding Issues	11
	C. Overall Analysis	12
	E. Zoning Ordinance Criteria for ZMAP Approval.....	17
V.	Attachments	20

I. APPLICATION INFORMATION

APPLICANTS **Daniel and Elizabeth Miller**
37824 Friendly Lane
Purcellville, Virginia 20132

APPLICANTS' REQUEST **A Zoning Map Amendment (ZMAP)** to delete an approximately 0.77 acre portion of a 0.99 acre property from the existing Goose Creek Historic and Cultural Conservation Overlay District (Goose Creek Historic District). The application was accepted on August 14, 2008.

LOCATION East of Lincoln Road (Route 722), north of Sands Road (Route 709), Village of Lincoln

TAX MAPY/PARCEL # /45/A/1////26/, PIN# 455-37-2171

ZONING CR-2 (Countryside Residential-2) and RC (Rural Commercial), Revised 1993 Zoning Ordinance

ACREAGE OF SITE 0.99 Acres

SURROUNDING ZONING/ LAND USES

	ZONING	PRESENT LAND USES
NORTH	CR-2	School / Residential
SOUTH	CR-2 / RC	Rural Residential
EAST	CR-1	Rural Residential
WEST	CR-2	Rural Residential

II. REFERRAL AGENCY COMMENT SUMMARY

TOPIC / ISSUE AREA	ISSUES EXAMINED AND STATUS
Comprehensive Plan	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> o Area subject to the land use policies of the <u>Revised General Plan (RGP)</u> (Rural Policy Area and Existing Village Policy Area - Village of Lincoln) and <u>Heritage Preservation Plan (HPP)</u>. o County commitment to protecting buildings, historic landscapes, and other features of particular historical significance in the context of their natural setting (<i>Historical and Archaeological Resources Policies, RGP Chapter 5</i>). Status: Unresolved. ZMAP application proposes to delete a Historic District designation. Local historic district designation is the only tool that protects historic resources in the County. The Victorian architectural style of the existing structure contributes to architectural significance of Goose Creek Historic District. o Historic and Archaeological Resources Policies of RGP call for the boundaries of the County's Historic and Cultural Conservation Districts to coincide with boundaries of the National Register Historic Districts and Virginia Landmarks Register Historic Districts (<i>Historical and Archaeological Resources Policies, RGP Chapter 5; Historic District Policies, HPP Chapter 4</i>). Status: Unresolved. ZMAP application proposes to remove property from the Goose Creek Historic and Cultural Conservation District. The National Register Historic District and Virginia Landmarks Register Historic District are larger than the local Historic District. This application seeks to reduce the size of the local District. o Historic and Archaeological Resources Policies of the RGP seek to maintain the composition and character of existing Historic Districts while providing opportunities for the expansion of existing Historic Districts and the creation of new Historic Districts (<i>Historical and Archaeological Resources Policies, RGP Chapter 5; Historic District Policies, HPP Chapter 4; Existing Village Policies, RGP Chapter 10</i>). Status: Unresolved. ZMAP application proposes to remove property from an existing Historic District.
Community Information and Outreach	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> o Village of Lincoln contains largest concentration of historic architecture in the Goose Creek Historic District. The Victorian architectural style of the existing structure contributes to architectural significance of Goose Creek Historic District. Status: Unresolved. Historic District Overlays are the only regulatory tool whereby local governments can protect and preserve historic buildings and areas of historic significance. The subject property is a contributing resource to a locally and nationally recognized historic district. Removal will undermine purpose and intent of local district designation and set precedence for piecemeal removal of properties, negatively impacting the collective preservation of cultural resources that create the Goose Creek Historic District.

TOPIC / ISSUE AREA	ISSUES EXAMINED AND STATUS
Zoning	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> o Meet criteria for designation of Historic Districts 6-1803(B) and criteria for Procedures for Designation 6-1806(B). Status: Unresolved. The Victorian architectural style of the existing structure contributes to architectural significance of Goose Creek Historic District. Removal of the subject property will undermine the Historic District Intent set forth in Section 6-1802. o Historic District Review Committee (HDRC) to consider application pursuant to Sections 6-1204(E) and 6-1808. Status: Resolved. HDRC to review application March 9, 2009. o Request for removal or exclusion of individual properties from historic districts to be applied for in accordance with Section 6-1200. Status: Unresolved. Applicant's Statement of Justification fails to address issues for consideration stated in Section 6-1211(E) and Historic District Criteria stated in Section 6-1803(B).
Virginia Department of Historic Resources (VDHR)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> o Goose Creek Historic District listed on Virginia Landmarks Register and National Register of Historic Places. District collection of architecture particularly significant as one of the largest Quaker homesteads in Commonwealth. Status: Unresolved. Subject property is a contributing property due to its location within a designated historic district and due to architectural characteristics of the structure on the property. Removal from the property from the local Historic District is not supported by VDHR.
Disclosure of Real Parties in Interest	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> o Received dated July 14, 2008

III. FINDINGS

1. The zoning map amendment application (ZMAP) to remove property from an existing Historic and Cultural Conservation overlay district is inconsistent with the Revised General Plan (RGP) and the Heritage Preservation Plan (HPP) which recommend the protection and preservation of Loudoun County's heritage resources while providing opportunities for the expansion of existing Historic Districts to coincide with the boundaries of national and state historic districts for the creation of new Historic Districts.
2. The Historic and Archaeological Resources Policies of the RGP outline the County's commitment to protecting buildings, historic landscapes and other features of historical significance to the County. An intent of the Historic District Ordinance is to maintain and improve property values through the conservation of the County's heritage resources. Removal of the subject property from the Historic and Cultural Conservation districts limits the ability of the County to preserve its cultural resources and may negatively effect property values of both contributing and non-contributing resources adjacent to the subject site.

3. The ZMAP is not in accordance with Section 6-1803(B) of the Revised 1993 Zoning Ordinance. The building on the subject property exhibits an identifiable exterior design and character that visually represents the architectural heritage of the Goose Creek Historic District. .
4. Historic District Zoning Overlays are the only regulatory tool whereby local governments can protect and preserve historic buildings and areas of historic significance. The subject property is a contributing resource to a locally and nationally recognized historic district. Removal of the subject property from the Goose Creek Historic District would undermine the purpose and intent of a local district designation and set precedence for piecemeal removal of properties, negatively impacting the collective preservation of cultural resources that create the Goose Creek Historic District.
5. The circa 1880 residence on the subject property is a contributing resource to the Goose Creek District which is recognized on local, state and national levels as an area of historic significance. The property is located in the center of the Village of Lincoln (Village) and is surrounded by historic residences of similar style and vintage. The Village contains the largest cohesive collection of historic architecture in the Goose Creek Historic District. The majority of the historic architecture in the Village, including the subject property, is representative of the late 19th century and is classified as "Victorian." This collection of buildings, in conjunction with the earlier Quaker architecture in the southern portion of the Village and the surrounding rural countryside, are the justification for the Goose Creek Historic District designation. The existence of both the quality and quantity of historic architecture in the Goose Creek area precipitated the creation of the local historic district. The purpose of the designation is the collective preservation of these resources. The application, if approved, will undermine local Historic District designation and its ability to preserve the County's historic and cultural resources.
6. The existing Historic and Cultural Conservation Overlay District allows for a reasonable use of the subject property that is consistent with the RGP and HPP and is compatible with the adjacent parcels.

IV. PROJECT REVIEW

A. CONTEXT

Application Summary

The Applicant has submitted a zoning map amendment application (ZMAP) to remove property from the Goose Creek Historic and Cultural Conservation District (Goose Creek Historic District). The 0.77 portion of the 0.99 acre property that is located within the Goose Creek Historic District contains a two-story Victorian vernacular residence constructed during the late-19th century (Figure 1). The property is located in the Village of Lincoln which contains the largest concentration of historic architecture in the Goose

Creek Historic District. The residence on the property is one of several buildings along Lincoln Road that represent the post-Civil War prosperity of the Village of Lincoln. These properties collectively contribute to the cultural heritage of the entire Goose Creek Historic District.

The Applicant states the property was erroneously placed in the Goose Creek Historic District. The Applicant also states nothing of historical significance occurred on the subject property or within the residence due to the fact that Cosmelia H. Janney, a local artist, did not live at the residence as stated in the Virginia Historic Landmarks Commission Historic District Survey Form completed by David Edwards in 1980 (Attachment 1b, page A-22). Lastly, the Applicant also states the existing structure on the subject property was originally constructed as a single room building, and due to subsequent additions to the building, there is not a clear architectural style to the building.



Figure 1. Northeast view of subject property from Lincoln Road. January 2009

Historic District Ordinance

First adopted in 1972, the Historic District Ordinance allows for the review and protection of the County's heritage resources through the designation of Historic Districts. The Historic District Review Committee (HDRC), created through the

Ordinance, acts on behalf of the Board of Supervisors in the review and approval of applications for a Certificate of Appropriateness (CAPP) for alterations or additions to existing structures, new construction, or the proposed demolition of any structure in a Historic District. Requests for removal or exclusion of individual properties from historic districts are subject to Section 6-1807 of the Revised 1993 Loudoun County Zoning Ordinance and require review by the HDRC.

Goose Creek Historic District

The Goose Creek Historic District is a rural district that was designated a Historic District by the Board of Supervisors in 1977. It is administered as a Historic and Cultural Conservation (HCC) zoning overlay to the Loudoun County Zoning Map. The eastern boundary of the Historic District was expanded in 2005 and currently encompasses approximately 11,000 acres south of Hamilton and Purcellville to the North Fork (Figure 2).



Figure 2. Goose Creek Historic and Cultural Conservation Overlay District
(Goose Creek Historic District)

The Goose Creek Historic District is unique to both the County and the state as the largest locally-designated historic district. It recognizes the architecture of the area and the historic settlement patterns as well as the agricultural landscape that characterizes this portion of the County. Within the Goose Creek Historic District boundary are both residences and agricultural structures that mark the evolution of the County's rural landscape over the last 275 years, from the earliest Quaker settlement to the present. As noted above, the Village of Lincoln contains the largest concentration of historic buildings exhibiting historic architecture from the 18th century through the early 20th century, including the Goose Creek Friends Meeting House.

The Historic District was listed in the Virginia Landmark Register in 1981 and the National Register of Historic Places in 1982. The National Register nomination for the Goose Creek District states that the Goose Creek area maintained the largest population of Quaker settlers in Virginia and that their unique cultural identity gave the "Quaker community a distinctive cast that is still reflected in the district's wealth of architectural and geographical resources." The nomination further states that "no other section of Northern Virginia contains more examples of stone architecture and few other settled rural areas of the Commonwealth possess such a high degree of unspoiled pastoral beauty..."

B. SUMMARY OF OUTSTANDING ISSUES

Staff recommends that the following issues be considered by the Planning Commission:

1. **Rural Area Policies and Existing Villages Policies / Heritage Preservation Plan Policies.** The request to remove the subject property and residence from the Goose Creek Historic and Cultural Conservation Overlay District (Goose Creek Historic District) is inconsistent with the policies of the Revised General Plan (Rural Policy Area and Existing Village Policy Area - Village of Lincoln) and the Heritage Preservation Plan which recommend the protection and preservation of Loudoun County's heritage resources while providing opportunities for the expansion of existing Historic Districts to coincide with the boundaries of national and state historic districts and while providing opportunities for the creation of new Historic Districts. The subject property is a contributing resource to the Goose Creek Historic District. (See Overall Analysis below at item C, Page 11)
2. **Zoning Ordinance Historic District Designation Criteria and Procedures for Designation.** Applications to create Historic Districts or to add land to existing Historic Districts are evaluated by criteria provided in Section 6-1803(B) of the Zoning Ordinance. The criteria for designation also pertain to applications to delete property from an existing Historic District. As such, the Applicant's request to remove property from an existing Historic District must establish that the property included in the Historic District does not contribute to the Historic District and that its removal from the Historic District would not negatively impact or undermine the purpose and intent of a local Historic District designation set forth in Section 6-1802. The subject property contains a building whose exterior design is that of an

identifiable character representative of the architectural heritage of the Goose Creek Historic District. The issues for consideration by the Planning Commission stated in Section 6-1211(E) as well as the criteria in Section 6-1803(B) have not been addressed by the Applicant (See Overall Analysis below at item C, Page 13).

C. OVERALL ANALYSIS

REVISED GENERAL PLAN

Land Use

The subject property is governed by policies of the Revised General Plan (RGP) and the Heritage Preservation Plan (HPP). The property is located within the northern tier of the Rural Policy Area and within an Existing Villages Area (Village of Lincoln).

The County has developed specific policies for the protection and preservation of its heritage resources (*Historical and Archaeological Resources*, RGP Chapter 5). These policies outline the County's commitment to protecting buildings, historic landscapes and other features of historical significance to the County in the context of their natural settings. The commitment includes working with landowners to convey the historic value of these resources to the community at large. Historic and Archaeological Resources Policies also seek to maintain the composition and character of the County's existing Historic and Cultural Conservation Districts while providing opportunities for the expansion of existing Historic Districts and the creation of new Historic Districts. For example, the eastern boundary of the Goose Creek Historic District was expanded in 2005 in order to add approximately 600 acres of land associated with Quaker settlement of the area. Plan policies also call for the boundaries of the County's Historic and Cultural Conservation Districts to coincide with the boundaries of the National Register Historic Districts and Virginia Landmarks Register Historic Districts. Similarly, the Existing Village Policies of the RGP encourage the preservation of historic structures and sites by promoting the establishment and expansion of the County's Historic Districts (Existing Villages Policies, RGP Chapter 10). Specific to the Goose Creek Historic District, the Historic and Archaeological Resources policies call for the County's *Historic District Guidelines* to be updated to recognize and give appropriate importance to the current rural-suburban character of the Goose Creek Historic District. New Historic District Guidelines were adopted in December 2008.

Goose Creek Historic District

As noted above, the Goose Creek Historic District Zoning Overlay was adopted by the Board of Supervisors in 1977 and is the largest Historic District in the County. The district is also listed in the National Register of Historic Places and the Virginia Landmarks Register. While state and national designation recognize the rural historic character of this area of the County, only local historic district designation protects historic resources through zoning regulations. The area was settled predominantly by Quakers in the mid 18th century around the Goose Creek Friends Meeting House in

what is now the Village of Lincoln. The architecture of the District is diverse, but a core inventory of stone, brick and log 18th and 19th century Quaker architecture are prevalent throughout the rural area. The Village contains the largest concentration of historic buildings exhibiting historic architecture from the 18th century through the early 20th century. Lincoln contains a core of vernacular Victorian style residences, a style specific to the late 19th and early 20th centuries. These remain a marker of post-Civil War prosperity for the Village. Though residential development has occurred in and around the Goose Creek Historic District, particularly over the last 10 years, it is important to note that the array of significant resources described in the National Register nomination have been largely preserved due to local historic district designation.

Subject Property

The subject property is a contributing element within the Goose Creek Historic District. The subject property contains a single-family residence constructed during the late-19th century (*Figure 2*). The two-story Victorian style house features a crossed gabled roof with arched two-over-two double hung windows and scalloped shingles in the gable ends. The front elevation of the house features a shed roof porch supported by turned wooden posts with decorative wood brackets. The house is clad with asbestos shingles which cover the original wood lap siding. The Applicant recently completed an addition to the rear elevation of the house, replaced the roof, and has raised the roof on the rear elevation.

The subject property is adjacent to other vernacular Victorian-style houses that were constructed around the turn of the 20th century. As a group, the houses contribute to the streetscape of the Village. The Village contains some infill development resulting in the subdivision of larger lots which are characterized by the construction of more contemporary mid-to-late 20th century residences. The inclusion of the subject property within the Goose Creek Historic District is important as the property contributes to the streetscape of the Village of Lincoln and maintains many of its character-defining Victorian elements.

Plan policies do not support the removal of properties from the County's Historic Districts, but instead support the expansion of existing districts to coincide with the boundaries of National and State historic districts, as well as the creation of new Historic Districts. Staff finds that removal of the subject property, which is integral to the integrity of the Village streetscape as well as the Historic District, from the Goose Creek Historic and Cultural Conservation District is not in conformance with the policies of the RGP and HPP. The Applicant has not provided any new information addressing the issue.

ZONING

The Applicant has submitted a zoning map amendment application (ZMAP) to remove property from the Goose Creek Historic and Conservation District (HCC) pursuant to Section 6-1807 of the Revised 1993 Zoning Ordinance (Zoning Ordinance). A Historic District designation is administered as a Historic and Cultural Conservation (HCC) overlay zone to the Loudoun County Zoning Map in addition existing zoning designations and associated zoning regulations applicable to the subject property (Section 6-1805). The property is currently zoned Countryside Residential (CR-2) and Rural Commercial (RC) and is located within the Lincoln Village Conservation Overlay District (VCOD).

The Historic District Ordinance allows for the review and protection of the County's heritage resources through the designation of Historic Districts (Section 6-1800). The Historic District Review Committee (HDRC) created through the Zoning Ordinance (Section 6-300) acts on behalf of the Board of Supervisors in the review and approval of applications for a Certificate of Appropriateness (CAPP) for alterations or additions to any existing structure, new construction, or the proposed demolition of any structure in a Historic District (Section 6-1900). Requests for removal or exclusion of individual properties from Historic Districts are subject to Section 6-1807 and require review by the HDRC pursuant to Section 6-1808.

Applications to create Historic Districts or to add land to existing Historic Districts are evaluated by criteria provided in Section 6-1803(B) of the Zoning Ordinance. The criteria for designation also pertain to applications to delete property from an existing Historic District. As such, the Applicant's request to remove property from an existing Historic District must establish that the property included in the Historic District does not contribute to the Historic District, and that its removal from the Historic District would not negatively impact or undermine the purpose and intent of a local Historic District designation as set forth in Section 6-1802. The Applicant's justification for removal from the Goose Creek Historic District and the Staff analysis of the application is provided below.

Section 6-1801 – Designation of Historic Districts

The Board of Supervisors may create Historic Districts subject to the submittal of written consent from a two-thirds majority of the affected property owners and by amendment of the Zoning Ordinance as provided in Section 6-1200. The Applicant states the property was erroneously placed in the Goose Creek Historic District due the fact that only one of the two property owners signed a petition requesting inclusion of the property in the Goose Creek Historic District and that both owners subsequently requested not to be included in the Historic District after the Historic District was legally adopted in February 1977. Staff first notes that the designation of the Goose Creek Historic District in 1977 was subject to the 1972 Zoning Ordinance which did not require property owner consent to form a Historic District or include property in a Historic District. Further, the County has found no evidence that the subject property was

erroneously placed in the Historic District. Pursuant to Sections 6-1807 and 6-1810 of the Zoning Ordinance, an application to delete property from an existing Historic District may be filed and processed in accordance with Section 6-1200, Zoning Amendment.

Section 6-1803(B) – Criteria for Designation of Historic Districts, Historic and Cultural Conservation District

Applications to create Historic Districts or to add land to existing Districts are evaluated by criteria provided in this Section of the Zoning Ordinance. The criteria for Historic District designation also pertain to applications to delete property from an existing Historic District. As such, the Applicant's request to remove property from an established Historic District must establish that the property included in the Historic District does not meet the purpose and intent set forth in Section 6-1802 and does not meet one or more of the following criteria:

- (1) Is closely associated with one or more persons, events, activities, or institutions that have made a significant contribution to local, regional or national history; or
- (2) Contains buildings or structures whose exterior design or features exemplify the distinctive characteristics of one or more historic types, periods or methods of construction, or which represent the work of an acknowledged master or masters; or
- (3) Has yielded, or is likely to yield, information important to local, regional or national history or prehistory; or
- (4) Possesses an identifiable character representative of the architectural, archaeological, and cultural heritage of Loudoun County.

The Applicant states nothing of historical significance occurred on the subject property or within the residence due to the fact that Cosmelia H. Janney, a local artist, did not live at the residence as stated in the Virginia Historic Landmarks Commission Historic District Survey Form completed by David Edwards in 1980 (Attachment 1b, page A-22). Staff notes that there are very few buildings in any of the County's established districts that are eligible for individual listing in the National Register of Historic Places. Historic Districts are designated because they contain a collection of buildings that, together, represent the historic settlement patterns and architecture of an area. Boundaries of historic districts encompass the greatest number of resources which individually contribute to the significance of the district as a whole. Each structure included in a Historic District is considered as a contributing resource to the overall significance of the Historic District. As noted above, the subject property contains one of several buildings representing the late 19th century Victorian architecture of the Village of Lincoln. These buildings, together with the earlier Quaker architecture in the Village Lincoln and the larger Historic District, contribute to the local and national significance of the Goose Creek District. The significance of the subject property as a contributing resource to the Village of Lincoln and to the Goose Creek Historic District as a whole is not dependant

on an individual historic figure or event. The subject property is not considered a contributing resource to the Historic District because of Cosmelia Janney's tenure on the property. Rather, it contributes to the Historic District because it is one of several historic buildings that, together, represent a specific period in the history of the Village of Lincoln which continues to be preserved.

The Applicant also states the existing structure on the subject property was originally constructed as a single room building, and due to subsequent additions to the building, there is not a clear architectural style to the building. Staff notes that the house was surveyed by the Virginia Landmarks Commission in 1980 and recorded as a simple frame Victorian residence built in 1880. There are several vernacular Victorian residences of similar size and style adjacent to the subject property along Lincoln Road. Although the recent demolition and construction work performed by the Applicant has amended the classic vernacular Victorian form of the building, the overall form and details (pediment, porch details, front cross gable roof, etc.) remain.

Based on the above, Staff has determined that the request does not meet the criteria necessary for removal of the property from the Goose Creek Historic District. The building on the subject property exhibits an identifiable exterior design and character that visually represents the architectural heritage of the Historic District pursuant to Section 6-1806(B) therefore meeting the purpose and intent of a Historic District designation (Section 6-1802).

Section 6-1204(E) – Required Action By Another Board and Section 6-1808 – Maintenance of Inventory of Buildings and Structures

Pursuant to these Sections of the Zoning Ordinance, the zoning amendment application (ZMAP) shall be forwarded to the Historic District Review Committee (HDRC) for review prior to presentation of the application to the Planning Commission or the Board of Supervisors. The HDRC is scheduled to review the application on March 9, 2009. Staff will brief the Planning Commission on the HDRC's recommendation at the public hearing.

Section 6-1807 – Additions or Deletions to Districts and Section 6-1810 – Appeals.

Pursuant to these Sections of the Zoning Ordinance, the procedures for adding or deleting a property from a Historic District may be applied for in accordance with Section 6-1200, Zoning Amendment, and will be processed, reviewed and approved/disapproved in accordance with Section 6-1800. The issues for consideration by the Planning Commission stated in Section 6-1211(E) as well as the criteria in Section 6-1803(B) have not been addressed by the Applicant. The issue is outstanding.

D. ZONING ORDINANCE CRITERIA FOR APPROVAL

Zoning Map Amendment Petition (ZMAP)

Section 6-1810 of the Revised 1993 Loudoun County Zoning Ordinance states "Removal or exclusion of individual properties from historic districts may be applied for in accordance with Section 6-1200 of this Ordinance...."

Section 6-1211(E) of the Revised 1993 Loudoun County Zoning Ordinance states " ... (i)f the application is for reclassification of Property to a different zoning district classification on the Zoning Map ..., the Planning Commission shall give reasonable consideration to the following matters ...":

Standard (1) Whether the proposed zoning district classification is consistent with the Comprehensive Plan.

Analysis The zoning map amendment application (ZMAP) to remove the subject property and residence from the Goose Creek Historic and Cultural Conservation Overlay District is inconsistent with the policies of the Revised General Plan (Rural Policy Area and Existing Village Policy Area - Village of Lincoln) and the Heritage Preservation Plan which recommend the protection and preservation of Loudoun County's heritage resources while providing opportunities for expansion of existing Historic Districts to coincide with the boundaries of national and state historic districts and while providing opportunities for the creation of new historic districts. The subject property is a contributing heritage resource to the Goose Creek Historic District.

Standard (2) Whether there are any changed or changing conditions in the area affected that make the proposed rezoning appropriate.

Analysis There are no changed or changing conditions in the area affected that make the proposed rezoning appropriate. In fact, the eastern boundary of the Goose Creek Historic District was expanded in 2005 in order to add approximately 600 acres of land associated with Quaker settlement of the area.

Standard (3) Whether the range of uses in the proposed zoning district classification is compatible with the uses permitted on other Property in the immediate vicinity.

Analysis The subject property would retain a CR-2 (Countryside Residential-2) zoning designation consistent with the Rural Area Policies of the Revised General Plan which designate the subject property for residential uses. The existing CR-2 zoning designation is compatible with uses on other property in the immediate vicinity.

Standard (4) *Whether adequate utility, sewer and water, transportation, school and other facilities exist or can be provided to serve the uses that would be permitted on the Property if it were rezoned.*

Analysis Adequate utilities, sewer and water, transportation and other facilities exist to serve the existing residence or are otherwise provided by the Applicant.

Standard (5) *The effect of the proposed rezoning on the County's ground water supply.*

Analysis The zoning application does not propose to expand the existing use on the subject property (residential) and will therefore not affect on the County's ground water supply.

Standard (6) *The effect of the uses allowed by the proposed rezoning on the structural capacity of the soils.*

Analysis The zoning application does not propose to expand the existing use on the subject property (residential) and will therefore not affect the structural capacity of the soils.

Standard (7) *The impact that the uses permitted if the Property were rezoned will have upon the volume of vehicular and pedestrian traffic and traffic safety in the vicinity and whether the proposed rezoning uses sufficient measures to mitigate the impact of through construction traffic on existing neighborhoods and school areas.*

Analysis The zoning application does not propose to expand the existing use on the subject property (residential) and will therefore not impact the volume of vehicular and pedestrian traffic and traffic safety in the vicinity of the subject property.

Standard (8) *Whether a reasonably viable economic use of the subject Property exists under the current zoning.*

Analysis The existing Historic and Cultural Conservation overlay allows a reasonable use of the subject property that is consistent with the Revised General Plan and Heritage Preservation Plan and is compatible with the adjacent parcels.

Standard (9) *The effect of the proposed rezoning on the environment or natural features, wildlife habitat, vegetation, water quality and air quality.*

Analysis The zoning application does not propose to expand the existing use on the subject property (residential) and will therefore not effect the environment or natural features, wildlife habitat, vegetation, water quality or air quality.

Standard (10) *Whether the proposed rezoning encourages economic development activities in areas designated by the Comprehensive Plan and provides desirable employment and enlarges the tax base.*

Analysis The heritage resources policies of the Revised General Plan (RGP) outline the County's commitment to protecting buildings, historic landscapes and other features of historical significance to the County. The intent and purpose of the Historic District Ordinance is to accomplish the purpose of the RGP through the protection and enhancement of the County's attraction to tourists and visitors (heritage tourism) which in turn provides desirable employment to Loudoun County and enlarges the tax base.

Standard (11) *Whether the proposed rezoning considers the needs of agriculture, industry, and businesses in future growth.*

Analysis The zoning application will not impact the needs of agriculture, industry, and business in future growth.

Standard (12) *Whether the proposed rezoning considers the current and future requirements of the community as to land for various purposes as determined by population and economic studies.*

Analysis The subject property would retain a CR-2 (Countryside Residential-2) zoning designation consistent with the Rural Area Policies of the Revised General Plan which designates the subject property for residential use.

Standard (13) *Whether the proposed rezoning encourages the conservation of properties and their values and the encouragement of the most appropriate use of land throughout the County.*

Analysis The heritage resources policies of the Revised General Plan (RGP) outline the County's commitment to protecting buildings, historic landscapes and other features of historical significance to the County. An intent of the Historic District Ordinance is to maintain and improve property values through the conservation of the County's heritage resources. Removal of the subject property from the Historic and Cultural Conservation districts limits the ability of the County to preserve its cultural resources. Preserving historic resources also may preserve property values of contributing and non-contributing resources adjacent to the subject site.

Standard (14) *Whether the proposed rezoning considers trends of growth or changes, employment, and economic factors, the need for housing, probable future economic and population growth of the County and the capacity of existing and/or planned public facilities and infrastructure.*

Analysis As noted above, the subject property would retain a CR-2 (Countryside Residential-2) zoning designation consistent with the Rural Area Policies of the Revised General Plan which designates the subject property for residential use.

Standard (15) *The effect of the proposed rezoning to provide moderate housing by enhancing opportunities for all qualified residents of Loudoun County.*

Analysis The zoning application does not propose to expand the existing residential use on the subject property.

Standard (16) *The effect of the rezoning on natural, scenic, archaeological, or historic features of significant importance.*

Analysis The circa 1880 residence on the subject property is a contributing resource to the Goose Creek District which is recognized on local, state and national levels as an area of historic significance. The property is located in the center of the Village of Lincoln (Village) and is surrounded by historic residences of similar style and vintage. The Village contains the largest cohesive collection of historic architecture in the Goose Creek Historic District. The majority of the historic architecture in the Village, including the subject property, is representative of the late 19th century and is classified as "Victorian." This collection of buildings, in conjunction with the earlier Quaker architecture in the southern portion of the Village and the surrounding rural countryside, are the justification for the Goose Creek Historic District designation. The existence of both the quality and quantity of historic architecture in the Goose Creek area precipitated the creation of the local historic district. The purpose of the designation is the collective preservation of these resources. The application, if approved, will undermine local Historic District designation and its ability to preserve the County's historic and cultural resources.

V. ATTACHMENTS (UNLESS NOTED OTHERWISE, ATTACHMENTS ARE NOT AVAILABLE ELECTRONICALLY BUT MAY BE OBTAINED FROM THE DEPARTMENT OF PLANNING)	PAGE NUMBER
1. Review Agency Comments	
a. Planning, Comprehensive Planning (10/08/08)	A-1
b. Planning, Community Information and Outreach (10/31/08)	A-7
c. Building and Development, Zoning (11/18/09)	A-27
d. Virginia Department of Historic Resources (10/16/08)	A-29
2. Applicant's Response to Referral Comments (12/31/08)	A-31
3. Applicant's Statement of Justification	A-33
4. Disclosure of Real Parties in Interest dated July 14, 2008	A-41